Retailer Practices and Youth Tobacco Access: What Communities Can Do to Minimize the Influence of the Tobacco Industry

Erin Ruel, MA; Niranjana Mani, BA; Elizabeth Molnar, JD, MA; Sandy Slater, MS; Frank Chaloupka, PhD

University of Illinois at Chicago
Health Research and Policy Centers
www.impactteen.org
The question we examine is how do community and retail managers restrict the tobacco friendliness of stores through both formal and informal methods.

- **At the community level**
  > Ordinances
  > Compliance checks and retail training

- **Retail managers**
  > Anti-tobacco signage
  > Training
  > Age checks
  > Compliance
  > Perceptions
Data for this talk come from the 1999 Impacteen community observations, which include:

- Store observations
- A survey of retailer practices
- Local ordinances
- Interviews with community leaders.
Data Collection

• In 1999 data were collected from 163 communities surrounding a national sample of 8th, 10th and 12th grade public schools.

• Trained field workers entered and conducted observations in up to 30 retail establishments, observed advertising in the surrounding community, and collected local ordinances in each community.

• Trained phone interviewers conducted CATI interviews with retail managers and clerks from a subset of observed stores.

• Trained phone interviewers conducted CATI interviews with community leaders based on initial list of eligible police and health departments; coalition members interviewed through snowball referral.
1999 Samples Used

- Store data consists of 3,031 stores and 1,627 managers.
- Manager response rate 54%
- Ordinance collection: n=158
  > Response rate 56%
- Community leader-response rate n=803 in 155 communities
  > Police dept.: 68%
  > Health dept.: 82%.

![Break-out of Store types](chart.png)
Advertising Ordinances

• Advertising Provision:
  > 5 of 157 communities have provision (3%).

• Restrictions:  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ad content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black &amp; white text only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warning label</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child eye level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad size</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Penalties:  
  > No penalties | 80% |
  > Graduated penalties | 20% |

• Pre-empted at Federal level plus complicated by 1st amendment.
Licensing Ordinances

- Retailer Licensing-Tobacco Sales
  - 18 of 156 communities (11.5%)

- Retailer zoning provision
  - 12%

- Penalties
  - No penalties: 28%
  - Penalty for any: 44%
  - Graduated penalties: 22%
  - Missing: 6%

- Licensing can occur at state or local level.
  - 59% of states license retailers to sell tobacco either by vending or over the counter.
Youth Access Ordinances

Any Youth Access Provision 38 of 158 communities (24%)

- **Sales to Minors:**
  - 34 of 38 (89%) communities have provision
- **Exemptions**
  - 12% with parental permission
  - 9% for purchase at work.
- **Penalties**
  - 32% have no penalties
  - 47% have graduated penalties

- **Proof of Age:**
  - 15 of 38 (39%) communities have provision
  - 53% directed toward retailers
  - 52% have graduated penalties
  - 7% entail clerk training

- **Misc. Provisions**
  - **Single/Out of Package sales**
    - 8 of 38 (21%) communities have provision and penalties
  - **Free standing/self service Display**
    - 10 of 38 (26%) communities have provision and penalties

43% of States pre-empt local youth access ordinances
Informal Community Efforts

- Only 35% of communities (n=55) are involved in compliance checks.
- One respondent/community: could be police officer, health official or coalition member.
Anti-Tobacco Signage by Store Type

- 65% of Stores have some type of anti-tobacco signage.
- Gas/Convenience stores have the most signage and supermarkets and drug stores have the least.
- Store specific could refer to franchise or store signs.
- Health warnings are generic non-sales to minors signs.
Provision of Age Checking Prompts

• Almost 100% of stores self-report that clerks ask for picture id’s to check age.

• Date of birth input cash registers are most restrictive. Pharmacies and grocery stores are most likely to have them.

• Cash register prompts less restrictive. Found most often in supermarkets.

• Calendar prompts are least restrictive. Found mainly in gas stations and convenience stores.

![Graph showing the proportion of stores using different age verification methods.](image-url)
**Clerk Training**

- Supermarkets are more likely than other stores types to have multiple trainings and gas stations are least likely.

- Five main training topics mentioned are proof of age, selling to minors, fines, resisting intimidation and health effects.

- Most stores include a total of 2 topics in their trainings.

![Bar chart showing the proportion of stores with single and multiple trainings, and the proportion of stores that cover different topics such as proof of age, selling to minors, fines, resisting intimidation, and health effects. The chart indicates that proof of age is the most commonly covered topic, followed by selling to minors, and the least common are health effects and resisting intimidation. The data is based on a sample of 791 stores.](chart.png)
Retailers’ Action to Comply with Laws Regarding Selling to Minors

- Supermarkets and pharmacies are more likely to say they watch their clerks.
- Convenience and gas/convenience stores are more likely to use in-store cameras.
- Gas stations are less likely than other store types to perform any of the specified actions yet are low on the ‘do nothing’ response also.
Consequences if Clerk Sells to Minor

- 42% of stores self-report that a clerk is dismissed if caught selling to a minor.
- Only 3% of stores fine clerks caught selling.
- 55% of stores provide a fairly negligible punishment for selling to minors.
Consequences if Caught Selling to Minor by External Agency

- Supermarkets are most likely store type to get a warning (62%) and grocery stores are least likely (15%).

- Convenience stores are most likely type to have a clerk fine (46%) and pharmacies are least likely (0%).

- Grocery stores are most likely type to be fined for selling to minors (63%) and Gas Stations are least likely (0%).

N=113
Reasons Managers Give for Selling to Minors

- Gas stations are most likely to say minors will buy elsewhere.

- Grocery stores and gas stations are more likely than other stores to say community doesn’t think selling to minors is a problem.

N=1627
Conclusions

• Ordinances are an important area for tobacco activists. Our data suggest they are incomplete.
  > Few local ordinances
  > Few with strict penalties
  > Problematic as a strategy as can be pre-empted at state or federal level.

• Results suggest that very few communities are actively regulating the retailer environment.

• Results also suggest that the retail efforts of managers is inadequate, but that more research is needed.
  > Signage use is high, but how effective?
  > Use of prompts is high but easily undermined.
  > Training is poor, compliance efforts are weak, and consequences are not very stringent.
Next Steps

• The retail environment is ripe for increased community involvement.
  • Improve upon informal areas.
    > Change manager perceptions: awareness of community concerns regarding youth tobacco use.
    > Increase community involvement in retail compliance checks.
    > Increase community involvement in retail clerk training.
  • Improve upon formal methods—ordinances.
    > Create local ordinances.
    > Establish strict penalties on existing ordinances.
    > Enforce existing ordinances.
    > Challenge pre-emption at state or federal level.